(II) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India and Bharat Electronics for the year 1993-94.

(III) Memorandum of Understanding between the Government of India and Bharat Earth Movers Limited for the year 1993-94.

THE MINISTER OF THE STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (SHRI MALLIKARJUN) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers :—

Memorandum of understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Defence) and the Bharat Dynamics Limited for the year 1993-94. (Placed in Library *See* No. LT4346/93).

II. Memorandum of understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Defence) and the Bharat Electronics for the year 1993-94. (Placed in Library *See* No. LT4347/93).

III. Memorandum of understanding between the Government of India (Ministry of Defence) and the Bharat Earth Movers Limited for the year 1993-94.(Placed in Library *See* No. LT4345/93).

Notifications of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension (Department of Personnel and Training)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, DEPARMENT OF ELECTRONICS AND DEPARTMENT OF OCEAN DEVELOPMENT AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI P R KUMARMANGALAM): Sir, on behalf of Smt. Margaret Alva I beg to lay on the Table, under sub-section (2) of section 3 of the All India Services Act, 1951, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training) :—

(1) G.S.R. No. 237, dated the 15th May, 1993 publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Third Amendment Regulations, 1993.

(2) G.S.R. No. 238, dated the 15th May, 1993 publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Pay) Third Amendment Rules, 1993.

(3) G.S.R. No. 258, dated the 29th May, 1993 publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Fourth Amendment Regulations, 1993.

(4) G.S.R. No. 259, dated the 29th May, 1993 publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Pay) Fourth Amendment Rules, 1993.

(5) G.S.R. No. 280, dated the 5th June, 1993 publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) First Amendment Regulations, 1993.

(6) G.S.R. No. 294, dated the 12th June, 1993 publishing the Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Fifth Amendment Regulations, 1993.

(7) G.S.R. No. 308, dated the 19th June, 1993 publishing All India Services (Death-cum-Retirement Benefits), Amendment Rules, 1993. (Placed in Library *See* No. LT4348/93).

Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India relating to Central Electronics Limited

SHRI P. R. KUMARMANGALAM : Sir, I also beg to lay on the Table, under clause (1) of article 151 of the Constitution, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India—Union Government—[No. 14 (Commercial) of 1992] relating to Central Electronics Limited. (Placed in Library *See* No. LT4231/93).

[The Deputy Chairman in the Chair]

RE. PROVIDING SECURITY TO SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHARY

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There will be clarifications regarding Calling Attention. I hope we finish it today. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, let me make a submission. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is a list of business and I have Mr. Jagesh Desai to

speak here.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No point of order.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : There is point of order in Zero Hour.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : This is not Zero Hour.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : One minute. Let me deal with it. I should tell you one point.. *(Interruptions)*... that if there is business before the House then you can raise a point of order. Are you raising a point of order regarding the Calling Attention? If so, then I will permit you.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : I am raising a point of order.. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Point of order regarding what ?

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : It is regarding what happened the other day, the day before yesterday in this House... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No.... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : It is a continuous House. You cannot disassociate it from what happened the day-before-yesterday and what happens today.. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. The thing is I must remind you again and the whole House that a point of order can be raised on a matter which is for discussion before the House. If you are raising a point of order on this Calling Attention then I will permit you. I won't object to it. But if you are raising a point of order on any other subject, I cannot permit you. So I will call Mr. Jagesh Desai.. *(Interruptions)*... I am asking you one question... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : It is only then you can decide whether it is relevant or not.. *(Interruptions)*... It is with regard to the procedure—how is the House to be conducted today?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The conduct of the House, you cannot discuss it on the floor of the House. There is another forum for discussing conduction of this House. This is not the forum where you can discuss the conduction of this House. Secondly, I asked you one simple question. Is it with regard to the Calling Attention which we are taking up? If it is regarding the Calling Attention, then I will permit you.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Mr. Rajesh Pilot made a promise in your presence the other day.. *(Interruptions)*... It is in connection with Andhra Pradesh. It is regarding the killing of a MLA... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : This order paper.. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Then don't raise a point of order because this is misuse of point of order. You must say 'point of information'... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : It is with regard to this order paper... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is it ?

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Madam, I have your permission.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You say that you want to find out.. *(Interruptions)*... You might say, 'point of information'. I will permit you. But the thing is you cannot come under another rule and ask for something else. You say 'point of information' and I will tell you what you are asking.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : The day-before-yesterday, when we discussed about the murder of a MLA of Telugu Desam in Hyderabad.. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, I am not permitting. We are not permitting anybody. Only one information.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh) : It is regarding my security as Member of this House.. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am sorry. I am very sorry.. *(Interruptions)*... If this is the way Members are not going to allow the Calling Attention to be continued, I won't permit anything.. *(Interruptions)*... You can discuss the matter, the Order Paper; you should discuss it with the Chairman; and this is not the place. .. *(Interruptions)*... Please, I am not permitting anything.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I want to know about my personal safety. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADAMANABHAM: This is a very serious matter...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Why can't I ask about my safety, Madam, even on the floor of this House? ..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): If a Member is complaining about her security, I think she has a right to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... If Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury is threatened, if she is in danger, she has a right to be heard. Madam, she has a right to be heard. ..*(Interruptions)*... If Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury is feeling insecure, then she has a right to speak. ..*(Interruptions)*...

Madam, she has a right to be heard. ..*(Interruptions)*... She is feeling totally threatened...*(Interruptions)*...

रेनुका बोलो.....

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: I have a right to seek clarifications from the Government, from the Parliamentary Affairs Minister.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I am not talking about Andhra Pradesh. I am talking about myself as a Member of this House...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): The Opposition Leader, the TDP Leader became the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly...*(Interruptions)*... This is the state of affairs there...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, the short point is that Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury who is a Member of this House wants to raise a matter about her personal security and she must be heard.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have got the information about Mr. Rajesh Pilot's statement, that he is making a statement at 5 o'clock. ..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Madam, even Mr. Rajesh Pilot does not ..*(Interruptions)*... my domestic help was arrested. My driver, my gardener were arrested. ..*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury, don't get agitated. ..*(Interruptions)*...

एक मिनट बैठ जाइए ....(व्यवधान)

It is not regarding Mrs. Renuka Chowdhury. I must be heard. It is not regarding Renuka Chowdhury. It is about the information Mr. Mentay Padmanabham has asked. So I am giving this information to the House that at 5 o'clock Mr. Rajesh Pilot is going to make a statement. All right.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I may be permitted to raise my issue, Madam. Please permit me to raise an issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya): Madam, ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You want to raise it or she wants to raise it? It is her security. ..*(Interruptions)*... All right. She is capable, please. She is capable to raise it herself. ..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Madam, ever since I contested against the present, sitting Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh in the recent..*(Interruptions)*... This is the attitude. ..*(Interruptions)*... I had been threatened. I have furnished letters and evidence to that extent to the Chairman, Rajya Sabha. This House discussed the matter of my personal security. The entire Opposition supported and made a demand that I should be given protection. And the Minister of Home had also given an assurance...*(Interruptions)*... The hon. Minister for Home had also given an assurance that he would give me protection. Madam, nothing happened. Now yesterday, in Andhra Pradesh there was some chaos, law and order problem; I don't know. ..*(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: That is created by you. ..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: This is not the way..*(Interruptions)*... I am not talking as an advocate of N. T. Rama Rao. I am talking as a member of this House. If none of you wants safety of a Member of this House, fine..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Let us be fair in presenting the facts.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: I think yesterday my domestic help was arrested

from my residence. My cook, my driver, my watchman, my gardener were arrested under Preventive Detention. My two children were left alone at home. My younger daughter is 8 years old. Madam, I am asking what justice is this. What is this? Madam, I have an editorial here in which it is stated that the Chief Minister has said, "Yes, there is nothing wrong if Renuka Chowdhury is chopped into pieces."... *(Interruptions)*... What is this? .. *(Interruptions)*... Yesterday, it is stated here, "Because she was a woman, she returned in one piece. Otherwise, for her behaviour, she would have been cut into pieces." Officials present expressed shock over the statement but the Chief Minister simply said, "Yes, what he said is true."... *(Interruptions)*... Is it because I am a woman? .. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI VISHVJIT P. SINGH (Maharashtra): Madam, I am on a point of order. While I have full sympathy for Madam Renuka Chowdhury and while I myself would urge the Government to provide whatever security is possible or is wanted by her for her protection, on the other hand, I feel that under no circumstances can any Member of this House get up and start levelling allegations against a Chief Minister... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: It is all on record... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Nobody has made any allegation. It is written in the newspapers that the Chief Minister did not deny it... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If she was threatened by the Chief Minister, against whom will she level the allegations?... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: The Chief Minister did not deny it; on the other hand, he confirmed it. What is going to happen?... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: They are trying to politicise the issue... *(Interruptions)*

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): सदर साहिबा, यह बहुत नामुनासिब बात है कि एक नामनेबल मैम्बर अपनी सेक्योरिटी का जिक्र कर रही है और उसमें रुकावट डालने की कोशिश की जाती है। यह बहुत अफसोसनाक बात है।

[نیتا ورودھی دل "شری سکندر بخت"

صدر صاحبہ - یہ بہت نامناسب بات ہے کہ ایک آنریبل ممبر اپنی سیکیورٹی کا ذکر کر رہی ہے اور اس میں رکاوٹ ڈالنے کی کوشش کی جاتی ہے - یہ بہت افسوسناک بات ہے -]

श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी: यह हाउस के फ्लोर पर एश्योरेंस दिया गया था कि

I will be given protection. The entire Opposition demanded it and an assurance was given. Then, why haven't they given me protection till today? Why?... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: It is unfair on your part... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Let the Home Minister respond... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): The Home Minister should respond... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: In spite of the direction, the Government failed to give protection... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: It is a very serious matter.::

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.:: *(Interruptions)* Mr. Mentay, I said, please sit down... *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Mr. Siva Reddy was killed because he was not given protection... *(Interruptions)*. I have reason to express my anguish... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mentay, please sit down... *(Interruptions)*. Just a minute... *(Interruptions)*. I will allow you. If a Member has raised about the personal security matter, nobody has any objection to it. Now as far as any allegations are concerned, I would like you to substantiate the matter... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: It was given in the newspapers and he has confirmed it. This is what was written in the newspapers... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

second... *(Interruptions)*. Please sit down... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : It is a question of the protection of her children... *(Interruptions)*. There is no protection for her children... *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY : You don't want me to say who is threatening... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : The same thing is happening in Tamil Nadu and nobody raises it... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Protection should not only be given for the Member but for her children also because they are in Hyderabad... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Home Minister is here. If she is substantiating, the Home Minister will take care of it. This is what I am saying. You don't hear... *(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN) : I may submit for the information of the House that since I had made this promise to the hon. Member that necessary protection would be given, I stand by it and I will definitely see to it that necessary protection is given to her... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : When will it be given? ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Madam, when will it be given?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now that matter is over ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : This assurance was given by the Home Minister a month ago...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That matter is over. I am not giving... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Madam, it is really unfortunate. The Home Minister gave this assurance during the last Session... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : This assurance was given in the last Session and almost three months are over... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Shri Jagesh Desai... *(Interruptions)*

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

Situation arising out of large scale disinvestment is Public Sector Undertakings

THE LEADER OF OPPOSITION (SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT) : Madam, I have an objection to it. I have raised it earlier also.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is your objection?

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT : My objection is about what has been said by the CAG about the Regulatory Committee in the DPE. Whatever has happened, has happened at the level of the DPE. Therefore, a statement should have come from the Minister concerned and, I think, it was absolutely wrong on the part of the Finance Minister to come and make that statement. Last time when I wanted to raise this issue, the presiding lady asked me, "Why did't you raise it at the proper time when the statement was made?"

'पहली चीज तो यह है कि वह स्टेटमेंट 13 पेज का था और उसके साथ एक पेज अलग था और इसके पहले कि स्टेटमेंट हमारे हाथ में आता, आनरेबल फाइनेन्स मिनिस्टर साहब ने पढ़ना शुरू कर दिया । इसके पहले कि हम कुछ कहते, हाउस एडजर्न हो गया । कोई मौका नहीं था । लेकिन मैं मान लेता हूं कि लगातार गलती हुई भी है और गलती मुसलसल जारी है । उसको एमेन्ड करने के लिए क्या करना चाहिए ? बिकौज, उन सवालात का जवाब देने के लिए कंसर्न मिनिस्टर को यहां मौजूद होना चाहिए । फाइनेन्स मिनिस्टर साहब, आप स्टेटमेंट कर चुके हैं, अब प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब तशरीफ लाये और हमारे क्लेरीफिकेशन्स का जवाब दें । इतना तो कम से कम हो सकता है ।

+[شری سکندر بخت : - پہلی چیز تو یہ ہے کہ وہ اسٹیٹمنٹ ۱۳ پیج کا تھا اور اس کے ساتھ ایک پیج الگ تھا اور اس کے پہلے کہ اسٹیٹمنٹ ہمارے ہاتھ آتا - آنریبل فائیننس منسٹر صاحب نے پڑھنا شروع کر دیا - اس کے پہلے کہ ہم کچھ کہتے - ہاؤس ایڈجورن ہو گیا - کوئی موقع نہیں تھا - لیکن میں مان لیتا ہوں کہ اگر غلطی

+[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.